



## Health Technology Assessment International

A New International Society for the Promotion of Health Technology Assessment

---

### Minutes of the 2006 Summer: Health Technology Assessment International Board of Directors Meeting

Date: Saturday, July 1, 2006

Time: 9:00 a.m. local time

Location: Meeting Room 1, Adelaide Convention Centre, North Terrace, Adelaide, South  
Australia, Australia

#### Present:

##### Board of Directors

Berit Morland, President (Norway)

Cliff Goodman, Director (United States)

Laura Sampietro-Colom, Secretary (Spain)

Diane Benner, Treasurer (Canada)

Americo Cicchetti, Director (Italy)

John Gabbay, Director (United Kingdom)

Chris Henshall, Past President (United Kingdom)

Jill Sanders, Director (Canada)

##### Observers

Finn Børllum Kristensen, Chair of INAHTA (Denmark)

Sadasivan Sivalal, Observer (Malaysia)

Brendon Kearny (Australia)

Alicia Granados (Spain)

#### Regrets:

Reiner Banken (Canada)

Helena Dahlgren, Director (Sweden)

Krzysztof Landa, Director (Poland)

Marjukka Makela, Director (Finland)

Egon Jonsson, Executive Director & CEO, Institute of Health Economics (Canada)

Jean-Francois Baladi, Director (United States)

#### Secretariat

Paul Childs, Director, HTAi Secretariat

Christine Batdorf, Administrative Officer, HTAi Secretariat (Canada)

Tania Stafinski, Acting Manager, HTAi Secretariat (Canada)

#### 1. Welcome – Apologies – Regrets

Dr. Morland opened the meeting by welcoming the Board members and observers to Adelaide, Australia, and to the summer 2006 meeting of the Society's Board of Directors. Regrets from a number of Board members and observers (reported above) were also provided.

Dr. Morland also reported that the Society's recruiting process was complete, that in conjunction with the Institute of Health Economics (IHE) a decision on hiring a full time Director had been made and that the successful candidate had accepted an offer of employment. Dr. Morland welcomed to the meeting the Society's new full time Director Mr. Paul Childs, who began work for the Society in mid-June.

## 2. 2006 Board of Directors Election Results

Dr. Chris Henshall, chair of the Nominating Committee, provided the Board with a report on the recently completed elections for four positions on the Society's Board of Directors. Dr. Henshall reported that in the Committee's view the election process was held in accordance with the Society's By-laws and governing regulations. Dr. Henshall then provided the following election results for the Board positions:

Vice-President: Reiner Banken (Canada, 1<sup>st</sup> year of 1 year term, followed by 2 years as President and 2 years ex-officio)

Secretary: Dr. Guy Maddern (Australia, 1<sup>st</sup> year of 3 year term)

Treasurer: Mitchell Sugarman (United States, 1<sup>st</sup> year of 3 year term)

Director: Karen Facey (United Kingdom, 1<sup>st</sup> year of 3 year term)

There was also a brief discussion of the potential for the appearance of a conflict of interest in the roles of sitting Board members also serving on the Local Organizing Committee (LOC) for HTAi 2008. This was not seen to be a material conflict, however concern was expressed about the appearance of a potential conflict in members fulfilling both of these roles.

Action: These results will be reported and confirmed at the Society's Annual General Meeting on July 3, 2006. By: BM and CH

The Executive will review the issue of a conflict of interest with LOC's and report back to the Board at its fall teleconference. Relevant material on board of directors conflicts will be sought by secretariat staff. Secretariat

## 3. Approval of Agenda

The agenda was approved with amendments to note that the discussion of the Secretariat (Item 5.2) and the report of the Publications Committee (item 6.2) would be held *in camera*.

#### 4. Approval of Minutes: 2006 Mid-Winter Board of Directors Meeting

Concern was expressed that record of the *in camera* discussion held during the February 2006 Board meeting did not accurately reflect the discussion held or the results of that discussion. Concern was also expressed about how *in camera* discussion were reported in Board minutes and how to balance the need for frank and open discussion during *in camera* sessions with the need for confidentiality in reporting those discussions.

Action: A revised version of that portion of the minutes will be drafted by outgoing Board secretary Laura Sampietro-Colom and circulated to the Board as constituted for the February meeting for review and approval. The final version of the minutes of the Mid-Winter Board meeting will be approved at the Boards fall teleconference.

By:  
Laura  
Sampietro-  
Colom and  
Secretariat.

Secretariat staff will review information on *in camera* discussions and provide recommendations on guidelines for their reporting to the Boards fall teleconference.

#### 5. Business Arising

##### 5.1 Annual Meetings

###### a) 2006 Adelaide

Dr. Sanders introduced this item by introducing Dr. Brendon Kearney, the chair of the Adelaide LOC. Dr. Kearney reported that as of July 1, there were 430 delegates registered for the conference, including spouses and partners of delegates, and that another 20 were expected to be registered by Sunday evening. Delegates representing a total of 42 countries were registered for the conference. The pre-conference scientific sessions and workshops were organized and ready to proceed.

Dr. Sanders reported that from her perspective there were three key lessons from working on the organization of the conference in Adelaide, these were:

1. The time requirements for the key organizer with the LOC were significant, on average approximately 2 days per week, or a .4 FTE PY;
2. Developing a relationship with funding sponsors for the conference is pivotal to ensuring their participation and satisfaction with their role as sponsors, and;
3. The next annual conference should have an increased role for countries in Asia and South America in order to develop improved relationships with these countries within HTAi. On a related note Dr. Morland reported that Mexico and Brazil will be seeking membership in INAHTA at that organizations upcoming meeting.

Action: None required.

b) 2007 Barcelona

Laura Sampietro-Colom provided a PowerPoint presentation on the 2007 meeting in Barcelona Spain. The presentation highlighted aspects of the conference program as well as the city of Barcelona. Some concern was expressed in ensuring that the promotional material and the title of 'HTA for Evidence-Based Public Health' appeal to all those who might be interested in attending, more specifically that the material not inadvertently lead people to not attend because they don't believe that conference agenda is relevant to them. The importance of identifying HTAi as the 'brand' for the conference was confirmed. Finally, the Board expressed a desire to ensure that the program for the Barcelona meeting provide a balance between 'traditional' HTA topics and HTA in public health.

Laura Sampietro-Colom reported that the Barcelona LOC had received a request from a group in Poland looking for a group discount for the 2007 conference. Members of the Board were not sympathetic to this request believing that there are sufficient opportunities for both organizations and individuals truly in need of financial support to attend Annual Meetings to request that support.

Action: The issue of group discounts was deferred to the Barcelona LOC for their discussion and resolution, with a clear indication that the HTAi Board was not supportive of this specific request. By: Barcelona LOC

c) 2008 Montréal

Dr. Veronique Dery, Chief Executive Officer and Scientific Director for AETMIS (Agence d'évaluation des technologies et des modes d'intervention en santé) provided an informative presentation on the city of Montreal and an update on planning for the 2008 Annual Meeting by AETMIS, the host agency. Issues around transparency and clarity in roles and accountability in relation to the HTAi Board and the Montréal LOC were also discussed, and it was agreed there would be ongoing discussion of these issues.

Action: None, ongoing issue.

5.2 Secretariat - In Camera

a) Recruitment of Director

Issues relevant to the hiring of Paul Childs as the first full time Managing Director of HTAi were discussed, as well as issues of concern relevant to the relationship between the Institute of Health Economics (IHE), where the secretariat is based, and HTAi were also discussed. It was recognized that the coming year we will be one where negotiation to develop clarity in the roles of the Director, the Executive Committee and the Board will occur.

Action: Dr. Morland will meet with Paul Childs during the course of the Conference to review the direction provide by the Board on the Directors position and their expectations of Paul Childs in the coming year. Both will report back to By: Berit Morland

the fall Board teleconference on progress made on identified issues through a work plan, with clear deliverables and a planning cycle and Paul Childs

b) Secretariat Services Provided to the Society

These issues were discussed *in camera*.

Action: Relevant issues regarding the evolving role of the secretariat in supporting the work of the Board will be addressed on an ongoing basis by the Director and the President, with regular reporting to the Executive Committee and the Board. By: Berit Morland and Paul Childs

5.3 Financial Report

a) Estimated fiscal year-end financial statement

A draft version of a year end financial statement was presented for discussion by Diane Benner to the Board. It was noted that while HTAi is in sound financial shape there was a lack of clear strategic direction on crucial financial issues; the existence of a reserve fund for a ‘worse case’ scenario involving shutting down of the Society was cited. As well, a need to develop a financial strategy that is driven by the Society’s strategic plan was also identified. It was noted that HTAi is now heading into the third year of its first five year plan and that this was an opportune time to review that plan, the progress made on it and laying the foundations for the next strategic plan. The need to realign the strategic plan from one that lays the foundation for the Society to one that addresses the needs of a growing and maturing Society was identified. Dr. Sanders, on behalf of CADTH, offered their assistance in addressing these issues, as well suggesting that a strategic planning session was needed in order for the Board to address the issues of a revised strategic plan.

In considering the financial report to the Society’s Annual General Meeting it was agreed that three key areas would be emphasized in that report, these are;

1. the finances of the Society are being managed in accordance with accounting rules and regulations;
2. the Society’s strategic plan and the role of finances within that plan are being addressed, and;
3. No immediate changes in how finances are managed by the Society are planned as rte current favourable financial position is a result of sound management since 2003.

The Financial Report was approved.

Action: Secretariat staff are to prepare a policy guideline for a reserve fund for the Society for the fall Board teleconference. By: Secretariat.

Secretariat staff will prepare a discussion paper for the fall Board teleconference on revising the Society’s 5 year Strategic Plan. By Secretariat

The financial report with the areas of emphasis noted will be provided at the

Berit  
Morland

b) Proposed 2006 – 2007 Budget

The proposed budget was discussed and no outstanding areas of concern were identified, however approval for the proposed budget for 006-2007 was deferred pending the reports from the Interest Sub-Groups and final approval of the 2005-2006 audited statements at the Fall Board Teleconference.

Action: Proposed budget for 2006-2007 to be presented to the Board at the Autumn Teleconference, after having received the reports and proposed expenses from all Interest Sub-Groups. By: Secretariat

Final approval of the 2005-2005 audited statements at the Board Teleconference. Secretariat

c) Forecasts for 2007 – 2008

These forecasts were received for information as part of the financial report.

Action: None required.

d) Recommended Appointment of Auditors

The approval of the Society's auditors will be made at the Society's Annual General Meeting.

Action: A recommendation for the renewed approval of Alan Welsh and Company as auditors will be made to the Society's Annual General Meeting. By: Diane Benner

5.4 Membership Update

This was provided as an information item. It was noted that HTAi's membership levels were approaching those of ISTAHC prior to its dissolution.

Action: Membership issues (recruitment and retention) are to be addressed as part of the review of the Society's strategic plan. By: Secretariat staff.

5.5 Board Sub-Committee Reports

a) Scientific and Professional Programs Committee

A verbal report on the activities of this committee was provided by Americo Cicchetti. An overview of the process used by the Committee to develop the scientific program for the conference was provided, as well as a description of the criteria used by the Committee to assess submissions for awards presented at the conference. The Board was also informed of the winner of first prize for papers at the conference. Finally, it was reported that the Committee is building connections so that it can accomplish the necessary work for a successful scientific program at the Barcelona meeting.

Action: None, ongoing activity reporting to the Board.

#### b) Membership Committee

Tania Stafinski provided a verbal report for this committee as an adjunct to the written report that was provided to the Board. It was reported that there is interest in various quarters in the creation of regional societies as sub-units of HTAi. It was recognized that this type of approach to the structure of HTAi raises a number of challenging issues, including membership fees, funding levels, and the connections between national, regional and international HTA bodies. It was recognized that changing the membership structure of the Society was a strategic issue that would have to be addressed as part of the process of addressing the Society's strategic plan. The specific issue of creating national HTA societies where they do not currently exist was identified. It was also noted that clarity in addressing this issue was essential to ensure that HTAi's role as an individual member based organization was not confused with INAHTA's role as an agency based society. It was also recommended that in developing support and connection with developing nations HTAi and INAHTA should work together to capitalize on unique strengths and mutual areas of cooperation.

Action: The report of the Committee and its work plan was received by the Board and will be considered for action at the Board's fall teleconference. By: Board

Regionally based HTA societies to be address in a revised strategic plan. Secretariat

#### c) Communications Committee

A written report and workplan was presented to the Board for their review. It was noted that some of the areas identified by the Committee in their overlap with the work done by other Committees of the Board, specifically the Scientific and Professional Programs Committee. It was agreed that clarity around strategic objectives would help to address and resolve this specific area of overlap, as well as other potentially problematic overlaps. The HTAi web site Vortal was also cited as an example of a communications tool where there were problems in uptake and use.

Action: The comments of the Board on their workplan will be reported back to the Communications Committee by the secretariat for the Committee's action. By: Secretariat  
Communications Committee

d) Policy Forum Committee

Dr. Henshall reported that long with a meeting of the Policy Forum Committee and members following the Board meeting the members of the Committee would be meeting on Sunday morning to discuss the results of the Saturday evening session. This session will serve to start discussions on planning the 2007 Policy Forum, some countries have been identified as a potential location for that meeting.

The following were also identified as members of the Policy Forum Committee for 2006 – 2007:

- Dr. Chris Henshall, chair
- Dr. Berit Morland
- Mr. David Ames
- Ms. Andrea Rappagliosi
- Ms. Andrea Sutcliffe
- Mr. Steve Pearson
- Mr. Jens Grueger

Action: Policy Forum program and location to be identified by the Committee and reported back to the Board.

By: Policy  
Forum  
Committee

6.0 New Business

6.1 Agenda for the Annual General Meeting

The agenda for the Annual General Meeting as well as a PowerPoint presentation highlighting the Society's achievements over the past year was presented by Dr. Morland to the Board. The agenda was approved.

Action: Agenda and presentation to be delivered at the Society's Annual General Meeting.

By:  
Berit  
Morland

6.2 Publications Committee Report – In Camera

Susan Bidwell provided a verbal as well as a written report from the Publications Sub-Committee. The core question that the Sub-committee felt need to be addressed was the relationship between Cambridge University Press (CUP) as the publishers of the International Journal of Technology Assessment in Health Care and the members of HTAi, specifically what members are looking for in a journal. Two key issues were identified as being in need of resolution;

1. survey of the members to determine what they need from a membership Journal, describing the possibilities
2. addressing the strategic issue of disseminating scientific HTA information to the Society's members., discussing where we "want to be in 5 years" with respect to publication policy.

It was recognized that addressing these issues is a complex question that will require specific expertise on communications and publications. Identifying what the membership's needs and desires are in a publication is seen as being an immediate priority. The expertise to do this was seen as being outside of the membership of HTAi and will require external advice and direction.

Action: A consultant is to be identified who can conduct a needs assessment for the Society and assist in the development of a solution for the Journal. By: Secretariat and Publications Sub-Committee

### 6.3 Reports from Interest Sub-Groups

#### a. Information Resources

A detailed PowerPoint presentation on the work of the Information Resources Sub-Group (IRG) was provided by Becky Skidmore and Susan Bidwell. The IRG was seen as being one of the most cohesive of the Interest Groups within HTAi, this is seen to be a result of it being a well developed international network with a clear sense of what they are working on and hope to achieve with the group. There was general agreement that the work of the IRG should be supported by the Board through endorsement of the funding request for 2006 - 2007 to the Board in their work plan however more detail is needed on specific issues.

Action: The funding proposal from the IRG is to be developed and more detail to be provided, specifically around developing long term funding and support for the IRG. The HTAi Vortal is seen as being the key instrument for general information and for linking the needs of the HTAi membership to the work of the IRG, The work with the Vortal should be taken forward. Options such as a linkage to the Cochrane Collaboration will be explored. By: IRG

#### b. Decision Makers

A written report was reviewed from this Interest Group outlining the accomplishments of the previous years and plans for the coming year. The focus of the group has been on facilitating sharing of information between decision makers. Using the HTAi web site as a way sharing information through posted articles and papers is being considered as well as developing a message board within the web site was also discussed. Linking the work of this group into the program into the program at the Barcelona will also be discussed.

Action: The interest will report back to the Board on progress and liaise with the appropriate committees regarding the program for the Barcelona meeting.

By:  
Decision  
Makers  
sub-  
group

c. Hospital Based HTA

A verbal report as well as a PowerPoint presentation on this Interest Group was received from Americo Cicchetti and Marco Marchetti. The group would like to use the HTAi web site as a way of sharing information on hospital based HTA information. A proposal on how this will be accomplished will be provided to the Board after the Interest Group meets on Monday at the annual conference. Future steps for the working group will also be developed for reporting at the Barcelona meeting.

Action: The Interest Group to develop a proposal for improved sharing of hospital based HTA for submission to the Board.

By:  
Hospital  
Based  
HTA  
Interest  
Group

d. Public Agencies

Dr. Don Juzwishin provided a verbal report as well as a PowerPoint presentation on the activities of this Interest Group.

During the course of discussion of this Interest Group it was noted that time constraints were affecting the ability of groups to report as completely as they would like and for the Board to review the work being done by the Interest Groups. A more effective way of conducting this portion of board business will be sought for future meetings.

Action: The Interest Group will report back to the Board with a proposed work plan at the Board's fall teleconference.

By:  
Public  
Agencies  
Interest  
Group.

e. Ethics

A PowerPoint presentation and verbal report from the Interest Groups chair, Christa Harstall on the activities of this Interest Group were received.

Action: None required.

f. HTA Producers/Scientists

No report was received from this Interest Group

g. Patient and Public Involvement

A report from this group was received from Laura Sampietro-Colom. She reported that the Interest Group distributed among all members a short questionnaire seeking institutions that included patients and citizens in their work however they had received very few responses. She also expressed disappointment with the level of activity in the Interest Group, for example material that had been posted to the groups' web site had received no comments. During the Adelaide meeting the chairs of this Interest Group will meet with members to discuss their ongoing availability and interest in continuing its work.

Action: None required.

A process for more effective reporting from Interest Groups, or more time allocated, will be sought.

7. Other Business

No other business was identified.

There being no other business the meeting adjourned at 4:45 local time.