HTAi
7th Annual Meeting Dublin 2010

SOURCES TO IDENTIFY POTENTIALLY OBSOLETE TECHNOLOGIES

Nora Ibargoyen-Roteta

[b]Osteba. Basque Office for Health Technology Assessment , Vitoria-Gasteiz

EUSKO JAURLARITZA
GOBIERNO VASCO
OSASUN ETA KONTSUMO SAILA
DEPARTAMENTO DE SANIDAD Y CONSUMO

Osteba

Introduction (I)

Osteba

“to promote the appropriate use of health technologies in terms of safety, effectiveness, accessibility, and equity, providing sufficient information for decision-making”.

Introduction (II)

- New and emerging health technologies identification process:
  - **Gentecs** (Spanish Network for the Identification of New and Emerging technologies
  - **EuroScan**: The International Information Network on New and Emerging Health Technologies

Introduction (III)

- **In 2008**: Spanish project related to the identification, prioritization and assessment of “obsolete” technologies

- **Obsolete technology**

  “Health technology or its application in a concrete indication whose clinical benefit, security or cost-effectiveness has been superseded in a significant way by other available alternatives”

Introduction (IV)

- How/where identify obsolete technologies?

Introduction (V)

- Possible sources:
  - "Passive" search:
    - Health Professionals' network
  - "Active" search by HTA agencies
    - Databases (Medline, Embase…)
    - HTA reports
    - Web sources…

Introduction (VI)

- Where to start an “Active search”?
- Previous works to identify internet sources for new and emerging technologies (Karla Douw et al, 2003…)
- No information about which sources could be used to identify obsolete technologies

Objectives

- To identify possible sources for the active identification of obsolete technologies
- To prioritize the most important ones for each technology type (device, drug, diagnostics…)

Methods: first step

EUSKO JAURLARITZA GOBIERNO VASCO

1. SEARCH STRATEGIES

QUESTIONNAIRE	
Have you used ever any search strategy to identify Obsolete technologies (as the definition says?) - Which ones? - To look at which database/s?	Yes ☐ No ☐
And for ineffective, harmful, cost-ineffective or inefficient health technologies? - Whi… - To l…	Yes ☐ No ☐

Any com…

EUSKO JAURLARITZA GOBIERNO VASCO

	OBSOLETE TECHNOLOGI…								
SOURCES (web links if possible)	Device	Diagnostics	Drug	Procedure	Programme	S…			
	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐				
	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐				
	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐				
	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐				
	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐				
	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐

OBSOLETE TECHNOLOGY:

"Health technology or its application in a specific indication whose clinical benefit, safety or cost-effectiveness has been superseded in a significant way by other available alternatives"

Methods: second step (I)

EUSKO JAURLARITZA GOBIERNO VASCO

INFORMATION SOURCES	POTENTIALLY OBSOLETE HEALTH TECHNOLOGIES								
	Device	Diagnostics	Drug	Procedure	Programme	Setting	Others		
http://www.epoc.cochrane.org/en/index.html									
http://www.npc.co.uk/									
http://www.nice.org.uk/									
http://www.tripdatabase.com/index.html									
http://search.medscape.com/all-search									
www.inahta.org									
http://www.iom.edu/CMS/2955.aspx									
www.cochrane.org									
www.racs.edu.au/open/asernip-s.htm									
www.htbs.org.uk									
www.york.ac.uk/inst/crd/									

Scanning the Potentially Obsolete Health Technologies

2

Osteba

EuroScan International Network

INAHTA

Osteba

Methods: second step (II)

- Sources depending on the technology type
- Different type of sources (Health Organizations, Journals...)
- Relevance from 1 to 9 (most important to less important)

Results for the first step

- 7/65 members of HTA-IRG list answered
- No search strategies or databases for Obsolete technologies
- Only 2 answers for ineffective, disinvestment strategies and in which databases

Results for the second step

- 17 agencies answered:
  - 10 did not work in this field
  - Remaining 7 agencies (1 only used experts)
- N º of answers for each type of technology:
  - Devices: 6/6
  - Diagnostics: 6/6
  - Procedures: 6/6
  - Settings: 5/6
  - Programmes: 5/6
  - Drugs: 3/6

Results for devices

TYPE OF SOURCE	SOURCE	Votes	Total	Median
HTA Organizations	Canadian Agency for Drugs and Technologies in Health	5	9	2
	The Cochrane collaboration	5	13	3
	National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence (NICE)	4	5	1
	Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality	4	11	3
	INAHTA	3	3	1
	Centre for Reviews and Dissemination (CRD)	3	3	1
	ASERNIP-S	3	4	1
	New Zealand Health Technology Assessment publications	3	6	2
	Institute of Health Economics	3	7	3
	Swedish Council on Technology Assessment in Health Care	3	13	4
Early Assessment& Alert Systems	EuroScan	4	10	2
	Australia and New Zealand Horizon Scanning Network	3	10	3
Health Organizations	NHS National Library for Health	3	11	5
Related organizations	ECRI Institute	3	5	2
Marketing authorizations	US Food and Drug administration (FDA)	4	6	1,5
Journals	JAMA	3	9	3
	British Medical Journal	3	11	5

Osteba

Results for diagnostics

TYPE OF SOURCE	SOURCE	Votes	Total	Median
HTA Organizations	Canadian Agency for Drugs and Technologies in Health	5	11	2
	The Cochrane collaboration	5	19	3
	National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence (NICE)	4	5	1
	Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality	4	10	2,5
	INAHTA	3	3	1
	Centre for Reviews and Dissemination (CRD)	3	3	1
	ASERNIP-S	3	4	1
	New Zealand Health Technology Assessment publications	3	6	2
	Institute of Health Economics	3	6	2
	Swedish Council on Technology Assessment in Health Care	3	12	4
Early Assessment& Alert Systems	EuroScan	4	10	2
	Australia and New Zealand Horizon Scanning Network	3	10	3
Health Organizations	NHS National Library for Health	3	11	5
Related organizations	ECRI Institute	3	5	2
Marketing authorizations	US Food and Drug administration (FDA)	4	7	1,5
Journals	JAMA	3	9	3
	British Medical Journal	3	11	5

Osteba

Results for programmes

TYPE OF SOURCE	SOURCE	Votes	Total	Median
HTA Organizations	Canadian Agency for Drugs and Technologies in Health	4	6	1,5
	The Cochrane collaboration	4	15	2,5
	National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence (NICE)	3	3	1
	INAHTA	3	3	1
	Centre for Reviews and Dissemination (CRD)	3	3	1
	Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality	3	4	1
	New Zealand Health Technology Assessment publications	3	6	2
	Institute of Health Economics	3	6	2
Early Assessment& Alert Systems	EuroScan	3	7	1
	Australia and New Zealand Horizon Scanning Network	3	10	3
Health Organizations	NHS National Library for Health	3	11	5
Related organizations	ECRI Institute	3	5	2
Marketing authorizations	US Food and Drug administration (FDA)	4	21	5,5
Journals	JAMA	3	9	3
	British Medical Journal	3	11	5

Results for procedures

TYPE OF SOURCE	SOURCE	Votes	Total	Median
HTA Organizations	The Cochrane collaboration	5	12	1
	Canadian Agency for Drugs and Technologies in Health	5	10	2
	National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence (NICE)	4	6	1
	ASERNIP-S	4	9	1,5
	Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality	4	10	2,5
	New Zealand Health Technology Assessment publications	4	11	2,5
	Centre for Reviews and Dissemination (CRD)	3	3	1
	INAHTA	3	3	1
	Institute of Health Economics	3	6	2
	Swedish Council on Technology Assessment in Health Care	3	13	4
Early Assessment& Alert Systems	EuroScan	4	10	2
	Australia and New Zealand Horizon Scanning Network	3	10	3
Health Organizations	NHS National Library for Health	3	11	5
Related organizations	ECRI Institute	3	5	2
Marketing authorizations	US Food and Drug administration (FDA)	4	22	6
Journals	JAMA	3	9	3
	British Medical Journal	3	11	5

Osteba

Results for drugs

TYPE OF SOURCE	SOURCE	Votes	Total	Median
Health Organizations	Canadian Agency for Drugs and Technologies in Health	2	3	1,5
	The Cochrane collaboration	2	10	5
Related organizations	ECRI Institute	2	2	2
Marketing authorizations	US Food and Drug administration (FDA)	2	10	5
Journals	British Medical Journal	2	1	1
	JAMA	2	1	1

International Journal of Technology Assessment in Health Care, 25:3 (2009), 1–6.

doi:10.1017/S0266462309990249

Scanning the horizon of obsolete technologies: Possible sources for their identification

Nora Ibargoyen-Roteta, Iñaki Gutierrez-Ibarluzea, José Asua, Gaizka Benguria-Arrate, Lorea Galnares-Cordero
Osteba, Basque Office for Health Technology Assessment

Objectives: The aim of this study was to identify and rank the sources for the detection of potentially obsolete technologies (POTs).
Methods: A specific questionnaire related to the search strategies and sources used for the identification of POTs and also for ineffective, inefficient or harmful health technologies was sent to the Health Technology Assessment International's Information Resources Group (HTAi-IRG) group. With the obtained information and taking into account the sources used for the identification of new and emerging technologies, a second questionnaire was elaborated and sent to EuroScan and International Network of Agencies for Health Technology Assessment (INAHTA) members, who had to select and score them. For the final ranking, the number of votes and the median score were taken into account.
Results: Seven HTAi-IRG members answered to the first questionnaire. Seventeen agencies answered to the second one (thirteen EuroScan members and four more members from INAHTA), but only seven had worked in the identification of POTs and one of them using only experts for it. The remaining six agencies answered the part related to devices, diagnostics, and procedures; five of them did it for settings and programmes and only three for drugs. The Canadian Agency for Drugs and Technologies in Health (5 votes; median = 2), Cochrane Collaboration (5 votes; median = 3), NICE (4 votes; median = 1), Food and Drug Administration (4 votes; median = 1.5), and EuroScan (4 votes, median = 2) were the most relevant sources for devices and diagnostics.
Conclusions: There is little experience on POTs identification. The identified sources provide mostly indirect information and further research should take place to determine the best use of them.

Keywords: Obsolete technology, Health technology assessment, Identification sources

Healthcare systems and organizations have the responsibility to decide which services will be incorporated into national health systems, determining the limits of their funding (12). In recent years, healthcare systems have been overwhelmed by a continuous increase of new health technologies; in 1994, Banta and Gelijns (1) found it necessary to develop a systematic approach to identify and select the most important appeared new and emerging technologies, evaluating them and communicating the obtained information to the decision makers, providing them more time for considering the future introduction of those technologies into the healthcare systems (9). The set of steps described by Banta and Gelijns (1) is known as a horizon scanning system (HSS), a system that is generally part of or is connected to health technology assessment (HTA) agencies. To identify new and emerging health technologies, most HSSs use a combination of resources, ranging from the Internet to clinical experts and the industry

We acknowledge and thank all HTA-IRG, EuroScan, and INAHTA members who had answered the questionnaires and provided information about their experience in this area, and especially to Elizabeth Adams, Susan Bidwell, Sophie Blanchard, Hans-Peter Dauben, Liz Dennet, Ingermaar Eckerlund, Adam Elshaug, Clifford Goodman, Nina Hakak, Janet Hiller, Don Juzwishin, Minna Kaila, Irving Lee, Sun-Hae Lee-Robin, Claire Parker, Doreen Pedlar, Jill Sanders, Leigh Ann Topfer, Marcial Velasco, Catherine Voutier and Lena Wallgren.

Conclusions

- First approach to identify sources of information for obsolete technologies
- Not many agencies working in obsolete technologies identification
- Sources are mostly indirect, as horizon scanning databases.
- About “obsolete technologies”:
  - Similar sources for devices, diagnostics and programmes
  - Little information about drugs

EuroScan for the identification of obsolete technologies

- From 2000 to May 2008: 1,129 technologies
- 270 classified as substitutive
- Possible obsolete technologies?
- Current study:
  - Search for HTA reports about the new technology
  - Search for current Clinical Guideline recommendations
  - Local Clinical experts opinion

Health professionals' participation

- Zahartek-Sortek: network for the identification of new and emerging technologies ... and obsolete technologies

Osteba

THANKS!!